

Innovation Lab Network Performance Assessment Project
Quality Criteria for Performance Assessments
What is the Enduring Legacy of the Emancipation Proclamation?

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
1. Focus on Deeper Learning				
a. Does the task require the demonstration and/or application of complex skills (e.g., Critical Abilities, DOK Levels 3 and 4, 21 st century skills, Key Cognitive Strategies)?*	✓			This task asks students to read and analyze the Emancipation Proclamation along with some other primary and secondary sources. Students must analyze these other sources to obtain background historical context and evidence they can use to address the prompt. They must evaluate other sources to assess their varying points of view regarding the Emancipation Proclamation and use that assessment in their written responses to the prompt. Collaboration in small groups and pairs is required at several points in planning an essay and communicating ideas. The task requires the demonstration of complex skills such as DOK level 3.
b. Can students' responses to this task (what students are asked to produce) provide evidence of important college/career readiness skills and Critical Abilities (e.g., collaboration, research skills, evidence-based communication)?*	✓			Students are asked to produce a coherent and well-structured explanatory essay based on analysis of a wide variety of documents. This essay can demonstrate evidence-based writing skills at a high level of complexity (stating a controlling idea, citing and reasoning about evidence from several sources, using context and content knowledge, assessing varying points of view, and demonstrating an ability to organize a well-constructed essay, etc.)
c. Does the task address key concepts and skills in the discipline that are transferable to other contexts?*	✓			The task focuses on the text of the Emancipation Proclamation of 1862. The Emancipation Proclamation and the materials provided on it here are relevant to many aspects of U.S. history leading up to and well beyond the Civil War. Hence the disciplinary concepts addressed by this topic are transferable to many other content areas or topics related to U.S. history and government. The task also guides students in a step-by-step process in the production of a carefully constructed essay asking students to read closely, refine a clear controlling idea, develop explanations based on the evidence of various documents, and assess varying points of view about the topic. This task entails the use of reading and writing skills that are transferable to many other contexts.
2. Alignment to Standards				
a. Does the task measure key skills and major claims emphasized by the Common Core State	✓			The task requires the use of several key skills emphasized by the Common Core – reading closely to make logical inferences from a text,

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
Standards (CCSS) and/or NGSS? *				comparing sources, evaluating conflicting points of view, and writing and revising a carefully constructed essay in response to the task prompt. The task measures all the skills described in the CCSS standards listed in the task instructions.
b. Can students' responses to this task (what students are asked to produce) be scored using CCSS/NGSS aligned rubrics? *	✓			Students are asked to produce a complex essay that closely analyzes one key primary source and relates it to corroborating information from several other primary and secondary sources, while also assessing contrasting points of view about the key source. The student must formulate a controlling idea and use evidence from the sources to support that idea in a carefully constructed essay. These writing skills correspond to those stated in several Common Core standards. Hence, student responses to the task can be assessed using the task's CCSS aligned rubric.
c. Are the scoring criteria--rubrics, point scoring systems, checklists (if provided)--aligned to key expectations of the CCSS/NGSS?	✓			The LDC Student Work Rubric - Argumentation provided is aligned with the CCSS standards relevant to this task.
d. Is the rigor of the task appropriately matched to the grade-level standards being assessed?	✓			This task is a challenging one for its grade 6-8 target group. The Emancipation Proclamation is a fairly technical, legal document that is not easy to read and understand. However, the scaffolding is such that students are well guided in defining relevant vocabulary, analyzing the document step by step, and considering other brief and usable sources that aid in analysis and comprehension.
3. Student Choice and Agency				
a. Does the task allow for a variety of responses and/or solution pathways? *	✓			Students must formulate their essay's own controlling idea in response to the prompt, they must arrive at their own understanding of the Emancipation Proclamation and defend their own point of view about it in relation to alternative views presented to them. They must write and revise their essay as they see fit and they must respond in varying ways in several collaborative efforts with other students.
b. Does the task offer opportunities for student ownership and student choice (e.g., selecting a research question or topic; selecting sources; etc.)?			✓	The opportunities for student ownership are limited. Students must respond to the task prompt by dealing with a single set of sources provided for them ahead of time. The instructions carefully guide students in assessing these sources and using them to address the prompt.
c. Does the task require student-initiated planning and management of information/data and ideas (e.g., determining				Students are given careful guidelines on how to analyze the sources, with sets of specific questions provided for note-taking on each of the main sources. A tightly structured process is detailed for discussing the

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
strategies for solving a problem; designing an investigation; deciding how to present findings; etc.)?			✓	varying views of the Emancipation Proclamation. A single outline structure is provided for students to follow in constructing their essays. Students do have to organize and maintain the information and the notes they generate and use in writing and revising their final essay. But this involves minimal planning and management.
4. Relevance and Authenticity				
a. Is task content represented in a way that is appropriately authentic (i.e., not overly hypothetical), relevant (i.e., relatable), and/or meaningful to students and the discipline (e.g., topic connects to students' lives, task simulates authentic purpose and audience)? *	✓			The task content is based on the text of the Emancipation Proclamation. It and the other sources used are vivid, authentic and not hypothetical. They are all still highly relevant today and meaningful both to students now and within the discipline of U.S. history.
b. Is the task related to real world problems, contexts, and/or purposes?	✓			Since the topic deals with a central episode in the history of slavery and the African American experience, it is certainly related in many ways to important real world issues today regarding race, politics, and the Constitution.
5. Suitable for Diverse Student Populations				
a. Is the task, at its core, free of bias that might disadvantage specific student populations and free of stereotypes in language, content, and design? *	✓			
b. Does the task include, or allow for the use of, a variety of stimuli?		✓		The task is based on several written primary and secondary sources. Almost all of the materials provided are written texts, although one short History Channel video is provided as well.
c. Does the task provide instructional scaffolds to support student learning and skill development toward successful completion of the task?		✓		The task provides only a few graphic organizers or other handouts to support some of the mini-tasks. However, the instructions for each mini-task are generally highly specific so that students should have a very clear understanding of how to complete them.
d. Does the task include appropriate recommendations for accommodations and differentiation to provide access for diverse students?			✓	Only one suggestion for such accommodation is made (see the top of page 13 of the instructions).
6. Design of Student Task				
a. Is the overall task prompt clear (e.g., clear student directions, unambiguous graphics)? *	✓			
b. Is task information presented in an organized		✓		The instructions are highly detailed and for the most part are very

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
way?				<p>clear. In a few places they are not entirely clear, however. For example:</p> <p>In the "text selection" section on page 7, it is not made clear what the "teacher-selected texts" are and where they are to be found. This does become obvious later on, but it would help to clarify at this point at the start what texts will be used and how they are to be accessed.</p> <p>In the first "Active Reading - Note-Taking" section (top of page 8) students are told to "add to their entries." It is not clear what "entries" refers to here or what is to be added to them. This needs some clarification.</p> <p>A vocabulary mini-task is placed at the bottom of page 11. This is after students are given several texts to take notes on. Should the vocabulary lesson proceed those readings?</p> <p>On page 13 and important article is referred to. It apparently presents several alternative views on the Emancipation Proclamation. But it is not clear how students are to access this article. Also, could not some graphic organizer be created to aid students in preparing notes for the discussion that this part of the instructions describes. This might also help students make better use of the discussion and incorporate some of its ideas back into the main essay task.</p>
7. Curriculum-Embedded				
a. Is the task feasible for most school/classroom environments (e.g., access to necessary resources)?	✓			
b. Does the task include opportunities for independent work as well as interaction/collaboration with peers?	✓			This task essentially asks students to write a well-researched and planned explanatory essay. This requires independent work. A good deal of collaboration in pairs and small groups is also provided for.

Task Materials	Yes	No	Comments
a. Is the task missing any referenced accompanying materials (resources, handouts, rubrics etc.)?		✓	
b. Does this task contain topics/materials/texts that might be sensitive for some students? If yes, please explain.		✓	The topic deals with sensitive issues regarding slavery and race. But the task itself handles all of those materials and issues in a completely fair and responsible way.

Comments: Students are asked to do a great deal of careful analysis of several sources having to do with the Emancipation Proclamation. The task is about a complex, important and challenging historical episode. Yet the task is clearly defined and delimited. Good scaffolding is provided to guide students in analyzing and using the sources provided, discussing them, and engaging in several collaborative activities preparatory to writing about them. The sources ensure that students will be able to gain a sense of historical context and use it to develop their essays in a meaningful way.

Criteria summarized in this document were derived from the following sources:

- *Quality Criteria for Performance Assessments*, SCALE, 2013
- *Criteria for High-Quality Assessment*, SCOPE, CRESST, LSRI, June 2013
- *Quality Performance Assessment: Harnessing the Power of Teacher and Student Learning*, Brown & Mevs, February 2012
- *ThinkReady Task Review Checklist*, 2013