Innovation Lab Network Performance Assessment Project
Quality Criteria for Performance Assessments
The Lottery

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
1. Focus on Deeper Learning				
a. Does the task require the demonstration and/or application of complex skills (e.g., Critical Abilities, DOK Levels 3 and 4, 21st century skills, Key Cognitive Strategies)?*	X			Task requires students to demonstrate the literary analysis skill of analyzing the impact of word choice on the tone of a short story, which is a complex skill, especially for sixth grade.
b. Can students' responses to this task (what students are asked to produce) provide evidence of important college/career readiness skills and Critical Abilities (e.g., collaboration, research skills, evidence-based communication)?*	X			Students' responses (essays) to the task provide evidence of literary analysis skills and writing skills, which are important college/career readiness skills. Responses also provide evidence of the Critical Ability called Communication in Many Forms. In addition, the module requires students to demonstrate the Critical Ability of Interpersonal Interaction and Collaboration.
c. Does the task address key concepts and skills in the discipline that are transferable to other contexts?*	X			Literary analysis and writing skills are transferable to other contexts. Oral communication skills and the skill of collaboration (which are demonstrated in the module) are also transferable to other contexts.
2. Alignment to Standards				
a. Does the task measure key skills and major claims emphasized by the Common Core State Standards (CCSS) and/or NGSS? *	X			Task measures Claim #1 (close reading and analysis of complex text) and Claim #2 (production of effective and well-grounded writing). The Module addresses Claim #3 (use of effective speaking and listening skills). The targeted CCS standards that are measured by the task are W.6.9 and RL.6.4. (Note: The Module says that the targeted standards are W.6.9 and RL.6.7, but most likely the writer meant RL.6.4, which specifically pertains to analyzing the impact of word choice on tone.)
b. Can students' responses to this task (what students are asked to produce) be scored using CCSS/NGSS aligned rubrics? *	X			Students' essays can be scored using CCSS-aligned rubrics.
c. Are the scoring criteria--rubrics, point scoring systems, checklists (if provided)--aligned to key expectations of the CCSS/NGSS?	X			Task uses the LDC Student Work Rubric—Informational or Explanatory, which is aligned to the CCSS.
d. Is the rigor of the task appropriately matched to the grade-level standards being assessed?	X			The module identifies the Lexile of the story "The Lottery" as 1130, which falls at the upper end of the CCSS grades 6-8 Lexile band. Because of the sophistication of the story, the task is rigorous for sixth grade, but it is an appropriate match for standard RL.6.4.

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
3. Student Choice and Agency				
a. Does the task allow for a variety of responses and/or solution pathways? *	X			See 3b below.
b. Does the task offer opportunities for student ownership and student choice (e.g., selecting a research question or topic; selecting sources; etc.)?	X			Students choose both how to describe the tone of the story and the examples from the text to illustrate/explain the impact of the author's word choice on the story's tone.
c. Does the task require student-initiated planning and management of information/data and ideas (e.g., determining strategies for solving a problem; designing an investigation; deciding how to present findings; etc.)?	X			Students must decide which examples from the text illustrate the impact of the author's word choice on the story's tone and how to organize their findings in an essay.
4. Relevance and Authenticity				
a. Is task content represented in a way that is appropriately authentic (i.e., not overly hypothetical), relevant (i.e., relatable), and/or meaningful to students and the discipline (e.g., topic connects to students' lives, task simulates authentic purpose and audience)? *	X			Task content is appropriately authentic since the tone of "The Lottery" is an important element of the story. The task may be meaningful to students because one theme of the story is conformity and following peer pressure, something that middle school students have to contend with on a regular basis.
b. Is the task related to real world problems, contexts, and/or purposes?	X			Task is related to real-world contexts because word choice affects the tone of all written matter, including news articles, advertisements, etc.
5. Suitable for Diverse Student Populations				
a. Is the task, at its core, free of bias that might disadvantage specific student populations and free of stereotypes in language, content, and design? *	X			At its core, the task is free of bias and free of stereotypes in language, content, and design. ELLs might be at a disadvantage to some extent when it comes to reading the language that is slang and/or dialect (e.g., "aint," "wouldn't have me leave m'dishes"), but most of the story is in standard English.
b. Does the task include, or allow for the use of, a variety of stimuli?			X	
c. Does the task provide instructional scaffolds to support student learning and skill development toward successful completion of the task?		X		Task provides instructional scaffolds to support learning and skill development. There is, however, no scaffolding to support student understanding of the meaning of "tone." Students should have some instruction on the meaning of tone either during the module or before the module, especially because the tone of the story shifts several

Quality Criteria	Yes	Yes, with Slight Modifications	No	Rationale/Suggestions
				times.
d. Does the task include appropriate recommendations for accommodations and differentiation to provide access for diverse students?			X	No recommendations for accommodations and differentiation are provided.
6. Design of Student Task				
a. Is the overall task prompt clear (e.g., clear student directions, unambiguous graphics)? *	X			The overall task prompt clearly tells students what they are supposed to do.
b. Is task information presented in an organized way?	X			
7. Curriculum-Embedded				
a. Is the task feasible for most school/classroom environments (e.g., access to necessary resources)?	X			
b. Does the task include opportunities for independent work as well as interaction/collaboration with peers?	X			The module includes instructional activities that provide opportunities for independent work and interaction/collaboration with peers.

Task Materials	Yes	No	Comments
a. Is the task missing any referenced accompanying materials (resources, handouts, rubrics etc.)? If yes, please indicate which materials are missing.	X		The short story "The Lottery" is not included, but the module states that it is available on the Internet. Several books are listed in the module and referred to in the instructional activities (e.g., *How to Read a Book*; *Making Thinking Visible*), and specific page numbers are referred to in the books, but these materials are not provided.
b. Does this task contain topics/materials/texts that might be sensitive for some students? If yes, please explain.	X		The short story "The Lottery" is basically about violence by the collective, and a particularly barbaric type of violence at that (stoning). This topic may be sensitive for some students (although it should be noted that many video games are much more graphically violent).

Comments: This is a challenging task for sixth graders due to the complex text being used (the short story "The Lottery" was first published in the *New Yorker*). Instructional scaffolding is very important, especially with regards to vocabulary. Many of the words that do impact tone are words that are at a higher grade level than sixth grade (e.g., boisterous, profusely), but there are also enough phrases that are sixth-grade level that students can use to complete the task.