**Subject area/course**: History/U.S. History

**Grade level/band**: 11

**Task source**: Providence Schools

**Does the End Justify the Means?**

**TEACHER'S GUIDE**

1. **Task overview**:

Students will write a position paper. Students will use the following questions to guide their research:

* *During times of war, do the ends ever justify the means?*
* *Did the ends justify the means used by the Allies in World War II in one of the following episodes of the war?*

1. The bombing of Dresden, Germany.
2. The refusal to bomb the routes into the Nazis' Auschwitz death camp.
3. The dropping of the Atomic Bombs on Japan.

In three small groups, students will also create and give a short PowerPoint presentation in class. In it, each group will illustrate and defend its findings and opinions regarding one of the above three actions.

1. **Aligned standards:**
2. **Primary Common Core State Standards**

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.11-12.1 Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources, connecting insights gained from specific details to an understanding of the text as a whole.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.11-12.2 Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.11-12.3 Evaluate various explanations for actions or events and determine which explanation best accords with textual evidence, acknowledging where the text leaves matters uncertain.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.11-12.7 Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, as well as in words)

1. **Critical Abilities**

Research:Conduct sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem, narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate, and demonstrate understanding of the subject under investigation. Gather relevant information from multiple authoritative print and digital sources, use advanced searches effectively, and assess the strengths and limitations of each source in terms of the specific task, purpose, and audience.

Analysis of Information: Integrate and synthesize multiple sources of information (e.g., texts, experiments, simulations) presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) in order to address a question, make informed decisions, understand a process, phenomenon, or concept, and solve problems while evaluating the credibility and accuracy of each source and noting any discrepancies among the data.

Communication in Many Forms: Use oral and written communication skills to learn, evaluate, and express ideas for a range of tasks, purposes, and audiences. Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, and rewriting while considering the audience.

1. **Other standards**

**The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards:**

D2.His.1.9-12. Evaluate how historical events and developments were shaped by unique circumstances of time and place as well as broader historical contexts.

D2.His.10.9-12. Detect possible limitations in various kinds of historical evidence and differing secondary interpretations

D2.His.16.9-12. Integrate evidence from multiple relevant

historical sources and interpretations into a reasoned argument about the past.

1. **Time/schedule requirements:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Monday** | **Tuesday** | **Wednesday** | **Thursday** | **Friday** |
| **Week 1** | Begin background reading and research | Continue reading and research | Start drafting the essay | Continue writing the essay | Continue writing the essay |
| **Week 2** | Peer editing – rough draft of the essay | Peer editing – rough draft of the essay | Students write final draft of the essay | Small Groups begin work on a rough draft of the PPT | Small Groups work on a rough draft of the PPT |
| **Week 3** | Small Groups work on the final draft of the PPT | ­Small Groups work on the final draft of the PPT | In-class presentations by all three small groups |  |  |

1. **Materials/resources:**

* U.S. History textbook coverage of World War II
* “The Bombing of Germany” documentary (short excerpt), A PBS "American Experience" program, accessed at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eVrK0hX40CQ>
* "The bombing of Dresden," a History Channel article at: <http://www.history.com/topics/world-war-ii/battle-of-dresden>
* "The United States and the Holocaust: Why Auschwitz Was Not Bombed," from the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum's "Holocaust Encyclopedia." <http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10008041>
* "U.S. Rejects Bombing of Auschwitz," from WW2History.com, <http://ww2history.com/key_moments/Holocaust/USA_rejects_bombing_of_Auschwitz>
* Why the allies didn't bomb Auschwitz, *The Guardian*, at: <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2009/sep/09/auschwitz-allied-bomb-second-world-war>
* Nathan Donohue, "Understanding the Decision to Drop the Bomb on Hiroshima and Nagasaki," the Center for Strategic and International Studies, August 10, 2012, at: <http://csis.org/blog/understanding-decision-drop-bomb-hiroshima-and-nagasaki>
* Richard Frank, "Why Truman Dropped the Bomb," *The Weekly Standard*, July 17, 2015, at: <http://www.weeklystandard.com/Content/Public/Articles/000/000/005/894mnyyl.asp?nopager=1>
* Additional sources as identified by students

1. **Prior knowledge:**

None provided.

1. **Connection to curriculum:**

None provided.

1. **Teacher instructions:**
2. As students prepare to read about World War II in their history class, thoroughly discuss with them the meaning of the question "Do the ends justify the means?" Have students explain that question as they understand it. Tell students they will be applying this question to one of three episodes or issues related to World War II. Review the "Student Instructions" with them to be sure they understand the task thoroughly.
3. Assign students their regular World War II reading. Briefly discuss the three episodes listed at the end of the "Task context" in the Student Instructions. Ask each student to choose one of these episodes to focus on. Have them read the relevant documents for their episodes listed in the Materials needed" section of the Student Instructions.
4. Tell students they are to do independent research in order to find some additional sources on their episode. Hand out copies of the "QPA Common Position Paper Rubric." Go over the rubric and tell students to keep the rubric in mind when organizing and writing their essays. Give them several days to do additional research and write a rough draft of their essay.
5. Pair students. Have students read each other's papers as homework and meet with them to offer suggestions. Tell students to use the QPA Common Position Paper Rubric as a guide in reviewing each other's rough drafts. Give students time to complete a final draft after the peer review sessions.
6. Divide students into three small groups. Each group is comprised of those students who chose the same episode to research and write about. Have students read and discuss each others' essays. Then give the groups time to prepare a brief presentation of their findings. They may decide to take a single position on whether the ends justified the means in their particular episode. Or they may wish only to summarize their differences in their presentation.
7. Have all three groups make their presentations and discuss the entire project with the class as a whole.
8. **Student support:**

None provided.

1. **Extensions or variations:**

None provided.

1. **Scoring:**

Student work can be scored using the QPA Common Position Paper Rubric and the QPA Common Oral Communication Rubric.