



**Literacy Design
Collaborative**

Should Animals be Kept in Zoos?

by Sharon K. Thurman and Angie Howard

While learning about the basic needs, adaptations, and ecosystems of animals, students will determine whether zoos are beneficial or harmful.


GRADES

3 - 4

DISCIPLINE

 **Science**

COURSE

 **Reading &
Science**

Section 1: What Task?

Teaching Task

Task Template 4-5.2 - Argumentation

Should animals be kept in zoos? After reading informational texts on animals and zoos, write an essay in which you answer the question and explain your reasons for your answer. Support your opinion with evidence from the text/s.

Standards

Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts & Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects

L.4.1

Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.

L.4.1.a

Use relative pronouns (who, whose, whom, which, that) and relative adverbs (where, when, why).

L.4.1.b

Form and use the progressive (e.g., I was walking; I am walking; I will be walking) verb tenses.

L.4.1.c

Use modal auxiliaries (e.g., can, may, must) to convey various conditions.

L.4.1.d

Order adjectives within sentences according to conventional patterns (e.g., a small red bag rather than a red small bag).

L.4.1.e

Form and use prepositional phrases.

L.4.1.f

Produce complete sentences, recognizing and correcting inappropriate fragments and run-ons.

L.4.1.g

Correctly use frequently confused words (e.g., to, too, two; there, their).

L.4.2

Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.

L.4.2.a

Use correct capitalization.

L.4.2.b

Use commas and quotation marks to mark direct speech and quotations from a text.

L.4.2.c

Use a comma before a coordinating conjunction in a compound sentence.

L.4.2.d

Spell grade-appropriate words correctly, consulting references as needed.

L.4.3

Use knowledge of language and its conventions when writing, speaking, reading, or listening.

L.4.3.a

Choose words and phrases to convey ideas precisely.

L.4.3.b

Choose punctuation for effect.

L.4.3.c

Differentiate between contexts that call for formal English (e.g., presenting ideas) and situations where informal discourse is appropriate (e.g., small-group discussion).

L.4.4

Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on grade 4 reading and content, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.

L.4.4.a

Use context (e.g., definitions, examples, or restatements in text) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.

L.4.4.b

Use common, grade-appropriate Greek and Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., telegraph, photograph, autograph).

L.4.4.c

Consult reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation and determine or clarify the precise meaning of key words and phrases.

RI.4.1

Refer to details and examples in a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.

RI.4.2

Determine the main idea of a text and explain how it is supported by key details; summarize the text.

RI.4.4

Determine the meaning of general academic and domain-specific words or phrases in a text relevant to a grade 4 topic or subject area.

RI.4.10

By the end of year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, science, and technical texts, in the grades 4—5 text complexity band proficiently, with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range.

W.4.1

Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information

W.4.1.a

Introduce a topic or text clearly, state an opinion, and create an organizational structure in which related ideas are grouped to support the writer's purpose.

W.4.1.b

Provide reasons that are supported by facts and details.

W.4.1.c

Link opinion and reasons using words and phrases (e.g., for instance, in order to, in addition).

W.4.1.d

Provide a concluding statement or section related to the opinion presented.

W.4.4

Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

W.4.5

With guidance and support from peers and adults, develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, and editing.

W.4.9

Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

W.4.9.a

Apply grade 4 Reading standards to literature (e.g., "Describe in depth a character, setting, or event in a story or drama, drawing on specific details in the text [e.g., a character's thoughts, words, or actions]").

W.4.9.b

Apply grade 4 Reading standards to informational texts (e.g., "Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text").

W.4.10

Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames

(a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of discipline-specific tasks, purposes, and audiences.

Core Content for Science

SC-04-4.7.2

Students will:

- describe human interactions in the environment where they live;
- classify the interactions as beneficial or harmful to the environment using data/evidence to support conclusions.

All organisms, including humans, cause changes in the environment where they live. Some of these changes are detrimental to the organism or to other organisms; other changes are beneficial (e.g., dams benefit some aquatic organisms but are detrimental to others). By evaluating the consequences of change using cause and effect relationships, solutions to real life situations/dilemmas can be proposed.

Texts

The EarthTimes Ask: Are Zoos a Force for Good or Just Plain Cruel?

In this article, two leading experts give their views on whether zoos are helpful or cruel.

Zoos: Good or Bad?

Environmental Ethics; February 28, 2012 Zoo supporters and opponents give their viewpoints.

Zoos: Good or Bad? - World Zoo Today

We are the zoo keepers of this planet. We cause animals to be endangered, and then protect them by putting them in zoos.

Are Zoos Cruel? Zoos need to change with public opinions.

Zoos- Good or Bad? A brief history or zoos followed by a list of pros and cons.

Why Zoos are Good

07/04/2012 Dave Hone discusses the positives of zoos including education, conservation, and research.

Zoos and Aquariums Help Save the World's Species!

08/09/2012 The World Association of Zoos and Aquariums (WAZA) publishes a report illustrating the unique contribution of zoos to the fight against extinction of species.

10 Facts About Zoos

03/03/2012 Captive Animals' Protection Society gives tens reasons zoos are bad.

Science textbook

Scott Foresman, publisher

LDC Student Work Rubric - Opinion/Argumentation

	Not Yet	Approaches Expectations	Meets Expectations	Advanced
	1	2	3	4
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task. D: Attempts to address additional demands lack focus, or does not address demands.	Addresses prompt appropriately, but with weak or uneven focus. D: Attempts to address additional demands are uneven.	Addresses prompt appropriately and maintains a clear, steady focus; stays on task. Provides a generally convincing position. D: Addresses additional demands sufficiently.	Addresses all aspects of prompt appropriately and maintains a strongly developed focus and convincing position; stays on task. D: Addresses additional demands with thoroughness and makes a connection to opinion or claim.
Controlling Idea	Attempts to establish an opinion or claim but lacks a clear purpose.	Establishes an opinion or claim.	Establishes a credible opinion or claim.	Establishes and maintains a substantive and credible opinion or claim.
Reading/Research (when applicable)	Attempts to provide information from reading materials but lacks connections or relevance to purpose of prompt.	Provides some details from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt with minor lapses in accuracy or completeness.	Accurately provides details from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt that support opinion or claim.	Accurately and effectively provides concrete details from reading materials to support opinion or claim.
Development	Attempts to provide details in response to the prompt, but lacks sufficient development or relevance to the purpose of the prompt.	Provides appropriate details to support and develop the focus, opinion, or claim with minor lapses in the reasoning, examples, or explanations.	Provides appropriate and sufficient details to support and develop the focus, opinion, or claim.	Provides sound reasoning and detailed information to effectively support and develop the focus, opinion, or claim.
Organization	Attempts to organize ideas but lacks control of structure.	Uses an organizational structure to develop reasoning and logic, with minor lapses in structure or coherence.	Organizational structure adequately supports and reveals the reasoning and logic of the opinion or claim.	Maintains an organizational structure intentionally and effectively. Structure enhances development of the reasoning and logic of the opinion or claim.
Conventions	Attempts to demonstrate standard English conventions, but lacks cohesion and control of grammar, usage, and mechanics appropriate to grade level. Sources not listed.	Demonstrates an uneven command of standard English conventions and cohesion appropriate to grade level. Uses language and tone with some inaccurate, inappropriate, or uneven features. Inconsistently lists sources.	Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion, with few miscues, as appropriate to grade level. Includes language and tone appropriate to the audience, purpose, and specific requirements of the prompt. Provides a list of sources with only minor errors.	Demonstrates and maintains a well-developed command of standard English conventions and cohesion, with few miscues, as appropriate to grade level. Includes language and tone consistently appropriate to the audience, purpose, and specific requirements of the prompt. Provides a list of sources using appropriate format.
Content/Subject Understanding	Attempts to include disciplinary content in opinion or claim but understanding of content is weak; content is irrelevant, inappropriate, or inaccurate.	Briefly notes disciplinary content relevant to the prompt; shows basic or uneven understanding of disciplinary content; minor errors in explanation.	Accurately presents disciplinary content relevant to the prompt with sufficient explanations that demonstrate understanding.	Integrates relevant and accurate disciplinary content with thorough explanations that demonstrate in-depth understanding.

Background for Students

A zoo is a facility in which animals are confined within enclosures and displayed to the public. Each year, millions of people visit zoos to get a close-up view of animals they may never get to see in nature. Although enjoyed by many, some feel zoo conditions are detrimental to the health of animals. Should animals be kept in zoos?

Extension

Not provided

Section 2: What Skills?

Preparing for the Task

TASK ENGAGEMENT: Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns.

TASK ANALYSIS: Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.

Reading Process

ACTIVE READING: Ability to identify the central point and main supporting elements of a text.

ESSENTIAL VOCABULARY: Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of text(s) by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY: Ability to use and credit sources appropriately.

NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.

Transition to Writing

BRIDGING: Ability to begin linking reading results to writing task.

Writing Process

CONTROLLING IDEA: Ability to establish a claim and consolidate information relevant to task.

PLANNING: Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an informational/explanatory task.

DEVELOPMENT: Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.

REVISION: Ability to refine text, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.

EDITING: Ability to proofread and format a piece to make it more effective.

COMPLETION: Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.

Section 3: What Instruction?

PACING	SKILL AND DEFINITION	PRODUCT AND PROMPT	SCORING GUIDE	INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES
Preparing for the Task				
50 mins	TASK ENGAGEMENT: Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns.	QUICK WRITE In a quick write, write your first reaction to the task prompt. Add some notes of things you know about this issue.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The student write his/her reaction to the task. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Watch the YouTube video "Top 10 Best Zoos in the World" (3.55 min. long) Top 10 Best Zoos in the World Have students share their zoo experiences. Discuss quick write responses.
50 mins	TASK ANALYSIS: Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.	LIST Make a bulleted list of 3-5 features of a good response to this prompt.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> They have a bulleted list of 3-5 features. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Share examples of type of text students will produce (either from past students or from professional writers). Make a bulleted list of features Pair/share to share and improve their individual bullets.
Reading Process				


Should Animals be Kept in Zoos?

PACING	SKILL AND DEFINITION	PRODUCT AND PROMPT	SCORING GUIDE	INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES
4 hrs and 15 mins	ACTIVE READING: Ability to identify the central point and main supporting elements of a text.	ANNOTATED TEXTS AND PLUS/DELTA CHARTS What is the most important thing the author is saying about the topic in a section? Which parts of the text show you that?	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Answers questions with credible responses. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The teacher will read the first article while modeling a think aloud that guides students to determine "the most important thing" the author is saying about the topic in a section. Using the article on the interactive whiteboard, the teacher will write comments from the think aloud in the margin and highlight important phrases. Next, the students will work in pairs to mark up the next sections of the text. With practice, students can independently mark up the text. Use two different color highlighters. For example: yellow to highlight "plus" (pro) and pink to highlight "delta" (con). Have students complete a plus/delta chart with information gained from reading each article and video clip. The plus/delta paper should be two-sided. Record article details on one side and video details on the other side. Invite students to share and discuss their answers for each text. After the discussion, allow them to add to their entries. In addition to reading the articles, have students view and discuss the following YouTube videos: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pro Zoo: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Jane Goodall on Role Zoos Play in Saving Wild Animals" 12 min. "Zoos and Conservation" 10.12 min. Zoos and Aquariums: Doing More for Animals" 2:41 min. Against Zoos: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Sad Eyes and Empty Lives" 5 min. "No Place Like Home" 5 min. "The Ethics of Zoos and Immature Animals" 5:47 min. <p>Notes:</p> <p>The Plus/Delta organizer is part of The Leader in Me Program. It allows students to list arguments for and against keeping animals in the zoo.</p> <p>Pacing will take at least five 50-minute class periods.</p> <p>Plus delta organizer for video</p> <p>Plus delta organizer for article</p>
30 mins	ESSENTIAL VOCABULARY: Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of text(s) by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.	LIST In your notebook, list words and phrases essential to the texts. Add definitions, and (if appropriate) notes on connotation in this context.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lists appropriate phrases. Provides accurate definitions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> After reading each article, ask some students to share definitions of terms they recorded. Those terms may include the following: enclosure, welfare, conservation, extinction, endangered, and species. After scoring, be willing to provide direct instruction or guide a close reading if needed to work through a key phrase most students missed. <p>NOTE: Listing vocabulary is to be done as students are reading articles.</p>

Should Animals be Kept in Zoos?


PACING	SKILL AND DEFINITION	PRODUCT AND PROMPT	SCORING GUIDE	INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES
15 mins	ACADEMIC INTEGRITY: Ability to use and credit sources appropriately.	SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE Define "plagiarism" and list ways to avoid it.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides accurate definition Lists several appropriate strategies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discuss respect for others' work to assemble evidence and create texts. Discuss academic penalties for stealing others thoughts and words.
50 mins	NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.	NOTES From each text, make a two-column list of the elements that look most important for answering the prompt. Do what you need to do to avoid plagiarism. <i>The students will use a two-column note organizer with "Reasons animals should be kept in zoos" on the left and "Reasons animals should not be kept in zoos" on the right. Students will use appropriate summarizing strategies in a bulleted list.</i>	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identifies relevant elements. Includes information to support accurate citation (for example, page numbers for a long text, clear indication when quoting directly.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Model how to use a two-column note organizer with "Reasons animals should be kept in zoos" on the left and "Reasons animals should not be kept in zoos" on the right. Students will use appropriate summarizing strategies in a bulleted list. Teach a model format for note-taking. Check that early student work is in the assigned format. <p>NOTE: <i>This may take more than one class period.</i></p>
Transition to Writing				
50 mins	BRIDGING: Ability to begin linking reading results to writing task.	LIST Now that you've read several articles about zoos, decide where you are on the continuum. Are you strongly or slightly pro zoo or strongly or slightly anti zoo?	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Participation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> On one end of the dry erase board, write "Zoos are good"; on the other end write "Zoos are bad." Have students stand along the continuum to show their opinions. Discuss evidence used to make the decision.
Writing Process				

Should Animals be Kept in Zoos?

PACING	SKILL AND DEFINITION	PRODUCT AND PROMPT	SCORING GUIDE	INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES
50 mins	CONTROLLING IDEA: Ability to establish a claim and consolidate information relevant to task.	CLAIM AND INTRODUCTORY PARAGRAPH Write an opening paragraph that includes a controlling idea and sequences the key points you plan to make in your composition	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Writes a concise summary statement or draft opening. Provides direct answer to main prompt requirements. Establishes a controlling idea. Identifies key points that support development of argument. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Offer several examples of opening paragraphs. Ask class to discuss what makes them strong or weak. Review the list that students created earlier to identify needed elements
50 mins	PLANNING: Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an informational/explanatory task.	FOUR SQUARE GRAPHIC ORGANIZER Create four-square graphic organizer based on your notes and reading in which you state your claim, sequence your points, and note your supporting evidence.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creates a four-square graphic organizer. Supports claim. Uses evidence from texts read earlier. 	Provide and teach the four-square graphic organizer.
Additional Attachments: <div>  Four square organizer </div>				
1 hr and 30 mins	DEVELOPMENT: Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.	INITIAL DRAFT Write an initial draft complete with opening, development, and closing; insert and cite textual evidence.	Student/Work Meets Expectations If: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides complete draft with all parts. Supports the opening in the later sections with evidence and citations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discuss "Informative organization" document. Encourage students to re-read prompt partway through writing, to check that they are on track.

Should Animals be Kept in Zoos?

PACING SKILL AND DEFINITION PRODUCT AND PROMPT SCORING GUIDE INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES

	<p>Additional Attachments:</p> <div>  <p>Informative organization</p> </div>			
50 mins	<p>REVISION: Ability to refine text, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.</p>	<p>REVISING YOUR DRAFT Refine composition's analysis, logic, and organization of ideas/points. Use textual evidence carefully, with accurate citations. Decide what to include and what not to include.</p>	<p>Student/Work Meets Expectations If:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides complete draft with all parts. Supports the opening in the later sections with evidence and citations. Improves earlier edition. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sample useful feedback that balances support for strengths and clarity about weaknesses. Assign students to provide each other with feedback on those issues.
50 mins	<p>EDITING: Ability to proofread and format a piece to make it more effective.</p>	<p>EDITING DRAFT Revise draft to have sound spelling, capitalization, punctuation, and grammar. Adjust formatting as needed to provide clear, appealing text.</p>	<p>Student/Work Meets Expectations If:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides draft free from distracting surface errors. Uses format that supports purpose. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Briefly review selected skills that many students need to improve. Teach a short list of proofreading marks. Assign students to proofread each other's texts a second time.
50 mins	<p>COMPLETION: Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.</p>	<p>FINAL DRAFT Review draft one more time. Turn in your complete set of drafts, plus the final version of your piece.</p>	<p>Student/Work Meets Expectations If:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fits the "Meets Expectations" category in the rubric for the teaching task. 	<p>Finalize draft by reading one more time and comparing to organizer.</p>

Instructional Resources

No resources specified

Section 4: What Results?

Student Work Samples

Advanced

 **Zoos adv**

Meets Expectations

 **zoos meets 1**

 **zoos meets 2**

 **zoos meets 3**

Not Yet

 **zoos not yet 1**

 **zoos not yet 2**

Approaches Expectations

 **zoos approaches 1**

 **zoos low approaches**

Teacher Reflection

Not provided

All Attachments

🔗 Are Zoos Cruel? Zoos need to change with public opinions. :

<https://s ldc.org/u/42x5n2fa44p6j8mz6blshg4g8>

🔗 Zoos- Good or Bad? A brief history or zoos followed by a list of pros and cons. :

<https://s ldc.org/u/1qcp2xgg3dfkscj1yigb21uq5>

📄 Zoos adv : <https://s ldc.org/u/crcvki7819ng9rjo0sjf6rcof>

📄 zoos meets 1 : <https://s ldc.org/u/bxxrd9i5zcma80v2prnv4qmzu>

📄 zoos not yet 1 : <https://s ldc.org/u/bde0czwdickavogv248e6exsp>

📄 zoos not yet 2 : <https://s ldc.org/u/a3mx0u00i6fpikciuq911ox6o>

📄 zoos meets 2 : <https://s ldc.org/u/c98a38lk1ij9n1gmju811vawp>

📄 zoos meets 3 : <https://s ldc.org/u/43a1syzykcotzpkj2hl4ir83d>

📄 zoos approaches 1 : <https://s ldc.org/u/5q9adhxt41umru41epnzvr0rw>

📄 zoos low approaches : <https://s ldc.org/u/a4bnxtanwvokkwxpjhtb647gv>