

Overview

Overview | Historical Fiction: Mostly True? (Revised)



Historical Fiction: Mostly True? (Revised)

by Mary Lynn Huie, Kathy Dulis, and Theresa Bennett

*Students in grade 5 will read the novel *The Mostly True Adventures of Homer P. Figg* by Rodman Philbrick. After reading the novel and taking notes on historic events described in the novel, students will read informational articles on the Battle of Gettysburg and evaluate the historical accuracy of the novel. The module addresses both ELA and Social Studies content standards.*

For more information about this modules, contact Kathy Dulis, Seaford School District, Delaware, kdulis@seaford.k12.de.us

Grades: 5

Discipline: *Interdisciplinary*

Teaching Task: *Elementary Task 1 (Argumentation and Explain)*

Author Information:

Mary Lynn Huie (Georgia)

Kathy Dulis (Delaware Department of Education)

Theresa Bennett (Delaware Department of Education)

Section 1: What Task?

TEACHING TASK

Elementary Task 1 [3 Levels]

Argumentation & Explain

L1: Is the Battle of Gettysburg accurately portrayed in the novel *The Mostly True Adventures of Homer P. Figg*? After reading the novel *The Mostly True Adventures of Homer P. Figg* by Rodman Philbrick and informational text(s) about the Battle of Gettysburg, write a letter to the author in which you answer the question and explain your reasons you believe the author has or has not accurately portrayed the Battle of Gettysburg in the novel. Give at least three examples from the novel and corresponding informational articles to support your opinion.

L2: What conclusion can you draw about whether or not an accurate portrayal of the events makes a difference when reading historical fiction. ?

STUDENT BACKGROUND

After reading the novel, you will read informational texts about the Battle of Gettysburg to build the knowledge needed to answer the task prompt. Think about how the author portrayed the historical events in the novel, and decide if the author portrayed them accurately.

EXTENSION

Rubric

Scoring Elements	Not Yet		Approaches Expectations		Meets Expectations		Advanced
	1	1.5	2	2.5	3	3.5	4
Focus	Attempts to address prompt, but is off-task.		Addresses prompt, but focus is uneven.		Addresses prompt with an adequately detailed response; stays on task		Addresses key aspects of prompt in a detailed response; stays on task.
Controlling Idea	Lacks a clear opinion.		Establishes an opinion though may lack clarity or credibility.		Establishes a credible opinion.		Establishes and maintains a substantive and credible opinion.
Reading/Research	Attempts to reference reading materials to develop response, but lacks connections or relevance to the purpose of the prompt.		Presents information from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt with minor lapses in accuracy or completeness.		Accurately presents details from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt to develop argument or claim.		Accurately and effectively presents important details from reading materials to develop argument or claim.
Development	Attempts to provide reasoning and details in response to the prompt, but lacks sufficient development or relevance to the purpose of the prompt.		Presents appropriate reasoning and details to support and develop the focus and opinion.		Presents appropriate reasoning and sufficient details to support and develop the focus and opinion.		Presents sound reasoning and detailed information to effectively support and develop the focus and opinion.
Organization	Attempts to organize reasoning, but lacks control of structure.		Attempts to organize reasoning within a structure		Organizational structure adequately supports reasoning.		Organizational structure enhances development of the reasoning.
Conventions	Lacks cohesion and control of grammar, usage, and mechanics appropriate to grade level.		Demonstrates an uneven command of standard English conventions appropriate to grade level.		Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions, with few errors as appropriate to grade level.		Maintains a well-developed command of standard English conventions, with few errors. Response includes language and tone appropriate to the audience, purpose, and specific requirements of the prompt.
Content Understanding	Attempts to include disciplinary content but content is irrelevant, inappropriate, or inaccurate.		Briefly notes disciplinary content relevant to the prompt; shows uneven understanding of content.		Accurately presents disciplinary content relevant to the prompt with sufficient explanations that demonstrate understanding.		Integrates relevant and accurate disciplinary content with explanations that demonstrate in-depth understanding.

STANDARDS

Common Core Anchor Standards Reading

R.CCR.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

R.CCR.2: Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.

R.CCR.4: Interpret words and phrases as they are used in a text, including determining technical, connotative, and figurative meanings, and analyze how specific word choices shape meaning or tone.

R.CCR.6: Assess how point of view or purpose shapes the content and style of a text.

R.CCR.10: Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently.

Common Core Anchor Standards Writing

W.CCR.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

W.CCR.2: Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.

W.CCR.4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

W.CCR.5: Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach.

W.CCR.9: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

W.CCR.10: Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audiences.

Common Core Anchor Standards Language

L.CCR.1: Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.

L.CCR.2: Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.

L.CCR.3: Apply knowledge of language to understand how language functions in different contexts, to make effective choices for meaning or style, and to comprehend more fully when reading or listening.

L.CCR.4: Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases by using context clues, analyzing meaningful word parts, and consulting general and specialized reference materials, as appropriate.

Common Core Anchor Standards Speaking and Listening

SL.CCR.1: Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

Custom Standards

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 1.1.6 Read, view, and listen for information presented in any format (e.g., textual, visual, media, digital) in order to make inferences and gather meaning.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 2.1.2 Organize knowledge so that it is useful.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 1.1.3 Develop and refine a range of questions to frame search for new understanding.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 1.2.1 Display initiative and engagement by posing questions and investigating the answers beyond the collection of superficial facts.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 3.2.2 Show social responsibility by participating actively with others in learning situations and by contributing questions and ideas during group discussions.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 3.1.3 Use writing and speaking skills to communicate new understandings effectively.

AASL STANDARDS FOR THE 21ST CENTURY LEARNER: 4.1.1 Read, view, and listen for

pleasure and personal growth.

DELAWARE HISTORY STANDARD THREE: Students will interpret historical data [Interpretation]. Historians collect and analyze both primary and secondary sources in order to describe, compare, and interpret historical phenomena. The same phenomenon or event may be presented from a variety of perspectives by different historians because they choose different questions to guide their inquiries, may have varied access to historical materials, analyze those sources differently, and are led by their own beliefs and points of view to weigh causes in distinct manners. Any comparison or evaluation of competing historical interpretations has to take these factors into account. 4-5a: Students will explain why historical accounts of the same event sometimes differ and will relate this explanation to the evidence presented or the point-of-view of the author. Essential for Grade 5

Section 2: What Skills?

Selected Skills

Preparing for the Task

TASK ENGAGEMENT: Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns

TASK ANALYSIS: Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.

Reading Process

ESSENTIAL VOCABULARY: Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of text(s) by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.

ACTIVE READING/NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; Ability to trace important plot events in a story.

ACTIVE READING/NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; Ability to compare events from a fictional story with a historical narrative and point out contradictions.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY: Ability to use and credit sources appropriately.

Transition to Writing

BRIDGING: Ability to begin linking reading results to writing task.

Writing Process

CONTROLLING IDEA: Ability to establish a controlling idea and consolidate information relevant to task.

PLANNING: Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an information/explanation task.

DEVELOPMENT: Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.

REVISION: Ability to refine text, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.

EDITING: Ability to proofread and format a piece to make it more effective.

COMPLETION: Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.

Section 3: What Instruction?

MiniTasks

Preparing for the Task

TASK ENGAGEMENT: Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns

LIST**15 minutes (first 3 columns only)**

Complete the Directed Reading/Thinking Activity so you can show me what you already know about the Battle of Gettysburg.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

DR/TA is completed.

Instructional Strategies:

Preview the informational text(s) selected.

Model the completion of the first three columns of the DR/TA (1) What they know about the Battle of Gettysburg (2) What they think might be true about the Battle of Gettysburg (3) What they think they may learn from the reading(s)

Discuss student responses.

Refer to DR/TA as students read the various texts to confirm or deny any claims they have made.

Students will complete the last column (4) What I have learned from the text(s) after reading.

Students will share out at least one claim that was confirmed; one that was refuted; and one piece of new knowledge.

Notes:

Use the DR/TA to determine what students already know about Gettysburg and supplement reading materials if necessary.

TASK ANALYSIS: Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.

LIST**20 minutes**

In your own words, explain what the question is asking you to do.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Completion of M-O-C organizer (What it means to ME; What it means to OTHERS; What it means to the CLASS)

Instructional Strategies:

Students fill in the first column individually. Each student should provide 3 important things he/she must do to complete the task.

Pair/group students for the second column. As a pair/group, have the students develop a list of 4 common things they must do to complete the task.

As a class, develop a list from those created by the teams. Have the students copy down this list in the third column.

Post classroom list so students can refer back to it as they work on the unit.

Reading Process

ESSENTIAL VOCABULARY: Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of text(s) by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.

LIST**ongoing**

Using the Knowledge Rating Scale (graphic organizer), list words/phrases from the texts that you may not be familiar with.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Completes Knowledge Rating Scale

Lists appropriate phrases.

Provides accurate definitions.

Instructional Strategies:

After each read, ask some students to share definitions of terms that others overlooked or misunderstood.

After each read, be willing to provide direct instruction or guide a close reading if needed to work through a key phrase most students missed.

Allow students to self-correct, or clarify information.

Notes:

Notes:

Some possible vocabulary to look for in the novel: commences; sharpshooter; addle; confers; enrollment; chicory; fidgets; requisition; upending; burble

ACTIVE READING/NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; Ability to trace important plot events in a story.

NOTES**1 day**

As you read each chapter, list important events related to the Civil War and the Battle of Gettysburg that take place. How is each character involved in these events?

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

note-taking guides are completed with relevant information for each chapter.

Instructional Strategies:

Model completing the Note-Taking Guide with a Think-Aloud for Chapter 1.

Have students read Chapter 2 with a partner, modelling the Think-Aloud process and completing the Note-Taking guide for Chapter 2 together.

Allow students to use the strategy for subsequent chapters as they read with a partner or independently.

Invite students to share and discuss the events and character involvement they have noted on their Guides..

After the discussion, allow students to add to their Note-Taking guides.

ACTIVE READING/NOTE-TAKING: Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; Ability to compare events from a fictional story with a historical narrative and point out contradictions.

NOTES

1 day

As you read the article "Gettysburg and the Civil War," list facts about events in the Civil War and the Battle of Gettysburg that support or contradict the events presented in the novel.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Completes Note-Taking Guide (below) with appropriate facts from the article identified as supporting or contradicting presentation of events in the novel.

Instructional Strategies:

Conduct a Think-Aloud with the first article, stopping for important facts and asking students whether those facts support or contradict the novel. Have students write those facts in the appropriate column on the Note-Taking Guide.

Students can follow the same protocol for each teacher-selected text. Invite students to share and discuss their notes for each text.

Instruct students to complete the final statement at the bottom of each Guide: "After reading this article, I think the novel is/is not 'mostly true' because"

Have students discuss their positions after each article. Students could vote or debate.

Notes:

Repeat this step with other informational texts, as appropriate for your group. Other articles include:

Gettysburg, Battle of (World Book)
High Tide at Gettysburg
Civil War Timeline (Very long/detailed)

*The note-taking guide is generic and would work with any of the texts.

Accommodations and Interventions:

Choosing the appropriate level and amount of informational text will vary from group to group. You may need more background information to make the claim if your students have not yet covered the Civil War in your Social Studies program.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY: Ability to use and credit sources appropriately.

SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

20 minutes

In a quick write, state why you think it is important to give credit to the original source when citing evidence, and how using the VIP strategy and annotations help you remember to return to the text(s) to support your claim(s).

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

student answers both parts of the quick write.

Instructional Strategies:

Have the students turn and talk: Discuss respect for others work to assemble evidence and create texts.

Report out to the group.

Have the students turn and talk: Discuss why we are using the strategies of VIP and annotations when we read.

Report out to the group.

Notes:

Scoring guide included.

This serves as a knowledge check to make sure students are reminded to return to the text to support claims.

Transition to Writing

BRIDGING: Ability to begin linking reading results to writing task.

NOTES

1 day

Using the OREO graphic organizer, organize the information you listed in your note-taking

guides and in the informational text(s) using annotations that will help you determine if the Battle of Gettysburg is depicted accurately in the novel.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

complete the OREO graphic organizer. (3 reasons and examples)

Instructional Strategies:

Small group discussion using question. Turn and talk...Share at least two examples of evidence from the text that will back up your claim. (Is the novel historically accurate or not?)

Whole group: Report out; create a two-column chart (Accurate/Not Accurate)

Whole group: Was the Battle of Gettysburg depicted accurately in the novel?

Notes:

This is a good time to discuss verifying information in more than one source. (Reason why we read more than one information text on the Battle of Gettysburg.)

In addition, this is the time to have the students discuss whether or not the Battle of Gettysburg is depicted accurately in the novel.

Writing Process

CONTROLLING IDEA: Ability to establish a controlling idea and consolidate information relevant to task.

SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

1 day

Write an opening to a letter in which you introduce yourself to the author, explains that you have read his novel, states whether or not you think the Battle of Gettysburg was portrayed accurately in the novel, and mentions the parts of the novel you will discuss.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Writes a salutation and concise opening to a letter.

Provides direct answer to main prompt requirements.

Establishes a controlling idea.

Instructional Strategies:

Offer several examples of openings to letters.

Ask class to discuss what makes them strong or weak.

Review the organizer students created in Bridging activity.

PLANNING: Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an

information/explanation task.

OUTLINE**1 day**

Create an outline based on your notes (OREO) and reading in which you state your claim, sequence your points, and note your supporting evidence.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Creates an outline.

Supports controlling idea.

Uses evidence from texts read earlier.

Instructional Strategies:

Teach/review the creation of an outline.

Model how to begin the outline.

Invite students to generate questions in pairs about how the format works, and then take and answer questions.

Students will work independently to complete the outline.

Accommodations and Interventions:

If your students need extra support, another graphic organizer could replace the outline.

DEVELOPMENT: Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.

LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**1 day**

Write an initial draft complete with salutation, introduction, body of the letter with textual evidence, and conclusion that restates the argument, and is in proper letter format.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Provides complete draft with all parts.

Supports the opening in the later sections with evidence.

Presented in proper letter format.

Instructional Strategies:

Encourage students to re-read prompt partway through writing, to check that they are on track.

REVISION: Ability to refine text, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.

LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**2 days**

As you read your partner's letter, use the Guiding Questions to provide feedback on how to improve his/her work.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Provides complete draft with all parts.

Supports the opening in the later sections with evidence and citations.

Improves earlier edition.

Instructional Strategies:

Sample useful feedback that balances support for strengths and clarity about weaknesses.

Assign students to provide each other with feedback on those issues. (Peer review process)

Notes:

Guiding questions for peer reviews:

1. Does my partner's letter have the required sections (Salutation, etc.)
 2. Does my partner's letter make sense? Is it organized in a clear manner?
 3. Does my partner's letter contain grammatical or spelling errors that take away from the meaning, or intent of the letter?
 4. Does my partner use the correct voice and tone?
 5. Does my partner's letter address the correct audience?
 6. Does my partner's letter answer the question in our prompt?
-

EDITING: Ability to proofread and format a piece to make it more effective.

LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

1 day

Revise draft to have sound spelling, capitalization, punctuation, and grammar. Adjust formatting as needed to provide clear, appealing text.

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Provides draft free from distracting surface errors.

Uses format that supports purpose.

Instructional Strategies:

Briefly review selected skills that many students need to improve.

Teach a short list of proofreading marks.

Assign students to proofread each others texts a second time.

Notes:

The second read through for the students is purely for grammatical and spelling errors.

COMPLETION: Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.

LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

20 minutes

Turn in your complete set of drafts, plus the final version of your piece

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Fits the Meets Expectations category in the rubric for the teaching task.

Instructional Strategies:

SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

20 minutes

Journal response: Does the accurate portrayal of historical events make a difference when reading historical fiction?

Scoring Guide (Work Meets Expectations If):

Answers the prompt

Gives at least two examples from the novel and corresponding texts in order to defend their position.

Instructional Strategies:

After students complete the final draft of the letter to the author, have them write a short constructed response answering the prompt. This activity will give them time to reflect on what they have learned.

Notes:

This can be an entry in a writing journal, etc.

Selected Articles

[Gettysburg and the Civil War.](#)

(<http://modulecreator.com/ModuleCreator/#page=login&moduleId=39802&scrollTo=articles>)

Cobblestone (May/Jun2010)Holzer, HaroldClemens, Mark

The article presents a brief historical account of the battle of Gettysburg, Pennsylvania, during the U.S. Civil War.

960L

[Civil War Timeline.](#)

(<http://modulecreator.com/ModuleCreator/#page=login&moduleId=39802&scrollTo=articles>)

Civil War Timeline (2009)McGill, Sara Ann

Presents a chronology of events related to the United States Civil War, from 1861 to 1865. Details and outcomes of significant battles, including Bull Run, Antietam, Gettysburg, and others; Impact of President Abraham Lincoln's Emancipation Proclamation on the war; Highlights of Lincoln's Gettysburg Address; Details of the Confederate surrender at Appomattox; Assassination of Lincoln.

1010L

[High tide at Gettysburg.](#)

(<http://modulecreator.com/ModuleCreator/#page=login&moduleId=39802&scrollTo=articles>)

Boys' Life (May95)Fleming, Thomas

Part II. Focuses on the Civil War battle in Gettysburg, Pennsylvania in July 1863. The Northern commander, General George Gordon Meade; Southern commander General Robert E. Lee; How the bloody battle was fought; Number of soldiers lost. INSETS: The Emancipation Proclamation;Black freedom fighters.

800L

Uploaded Files

[ANNOTATION SYMBOLS.docx](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/103101468_Nov_21_2013_134258678.docx)

Annotation symbols--Informational texts

[DRTA.docx](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/1971038419_Nov_21_2013_142111869.docx)

DR/TA Used to activate prior knowledge, and to confirm or refute predictions.Task Engagement

[MOC.docx](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/114480429_Nov_21_2013_134323552.docx)

M-O-C

 [Vocabulary Rating Scale.docx](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/627677741_Nov_21_2013_135638186.docx)

Knowledge Rating Scale--Vocabulary This could be edited to include other words. The students have the opportunity to add to the list of words.

 [OREO opinion graphic organizer\[2\].pdf](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/2021772078_Dec_19_2013_103200782.pdf)

OREO Graphic Organizer

 [Mostly True Notetaking Guides.docx](#)

(http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/39802/1990871889_Sep_29_2014_142846812.docx)

Note-taking guides for novel and articles

Keywords

*Links**

* These Lexile measures were computed automatically and did not undergo human review. They are not certified measures and should not be published or recorded in any way.

Other Resources

 Gettysburg, Battle of

World Book Online article for Battle of Gettysburg. Lexile level is 1000L.

 Ten Facts About Gettysburg

<http://www.civilwar.org/battlefields/gettysburg/assets/ten-facts-about/ten-facts-about-gettysburg.html> Brief history of the Battle of Gettysburg

 The Mostly True Adventures of Homer P. Figg

Novel by Rodman Philbrick. Lexile level is 950L.

 Battle of Gettysburg

factsforkids.net's information on the Battle of Gettysburg <http://factsforkids.net/battle-of-gettysburg-facts/>

Section 4: What Results?

Classroom Assessment Rubric	
Not Yet	
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.
Reading/Research	Demonstrates weak use of reading material to develop argument.
Controlling Idea	Establishes a claim and attempts to support an argument but is not convincing; (L2) Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments.
Development	Reasoning is not clear; examples or explanations are weak or irrelevant. (L3) Connection is weak or not relevant.
Organization	Provides an ineffective structure; composition does not address requirements of the prompt.
Conventions	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.
Meets Expectations	
Focus	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response.
Reading/Research	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading material to develop an argument.
Controlling Idea	Establishes a credible claim and supports an argument that is logical and generally convincing. (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim.
Development	Develops reasoning to support claim; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument (L3) Makes a relevant connection(s) that supports argument.
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure to address specific requirements of the prompt.
Conventions	Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.

Classroom Assessment Task
No Classroom Assessment Task for this module

Exemplar Work
<i>Uploaded Files</i>

Comments

Author Notes

Other Comments